Voting Accessibility Advisory Committee – Tuesday 5/8/2018

In attendance:

John Arntz, Department of Elections
Nataliya Kuzina, Department of Elections
Nicole Bohn, Mayor's Office on Disability
Jane Ferguson Flout, Catholic Charites San Francisco
Fiona Hinze, Independent Living Resource Center
Fred Nisen, Disability Rights California
Andy Pastalaniec, Department of Elections
Bill Hershon, Disability Rights California
Jonathan Aaberg, Department of Elections
Elizabeth Ann Dunlap, Poll Worker
Aurora Livingston, Department of Elections
Francis Lau, State Council on Developmental Disabilities
Hillary Brown, Poll Worker
Marti Goddard, San Francisco Public Library, Access Services
Lisa Maria Martinez, Lighthouse for the Blind and Visually Impaired
Heather Kittel, Mayor's Office on Disability
Jane Glasby, San Francisco Public Library
Shane Burgos, Department of Elections
Clint Wolfrom, Department of Elections
Mayank Patel, Department of Elections
Val Shilov, Department of Elections
Crispin Tirso, Department of Elections
Leo Samuelson, Department of Elections
Sascha Bittner, State Council on Developmental Disabilities
Steven Bennett, Dominion Voting
Nick Coudsy, Dominion Voting
Alice Chiu, Senior & Disability Action

Meeting Minutes:

1. Nataliya Kuzina gave a presentation on the Department of Elections new Remote Accessible Vote-by-Mail (RAVBM) System now available for the June 5, 2018 Election.
    a. The Department is disseminating information about the system to the public in various ways such as
        i. Creating a page on sfelections.org with information and frequently asked questions about the system
        ii. Publishing information in the Voter Information Pamphlet as well as on the Voting Instructions that are sent to all vote-by-mail voters along with their ballot.

iii. Partnering with Library for the Blind and Print Disabled to provide information to their clients via email blast, in braille, and large print.

iv. Producing outreach materials and adding information to the Department's voter education presentations

v. Contacting nearly 70 organizations serving primarily people with disabilities and seniors and scheduling events at their facilities

b. What is the RAVBM System?

i. It is a ballot delivery option that allows voters with disabilities to access and mark their ballot from any computer with internet access in a screen-readable format. This service provides an opportunity for accessible voting option without having to go to a polling place on Election Day. Accessible voting equipment will also be available at polling places on Election Day and at the City Hall Voting Center.

ii. Voters must also have access to a printer to print their marked ballot

c. Who is eligible to use the system?

i. Under California law, only voters with disabilities and voters in the military or living overseas are eligible to use this system.

ii. To access the ballot, a person must be registered as a vote-by-mail voter.

1. To apply as a vote-by-mail voter a person may submit a paper application, apply online at sfelections.org/vbm or call (415) 554-4375 or TTY: (415) 554-4386

d. When can a voter access their ballot through the system?

i. A voter may access their ballot Monday, May 7 through Election Day, Tuesday, June 5

e. Steps for accessing the ballot include:

i. Visiting the RAVBM System Portal at **sfelections.org/access**

ii. In the portal, the voter will enter their San Francisco house number and zip code associated with their voter registration as well as date of birth and click submit.

iii. Next, the voter will be taken to the Welcome screen where they can select the language they prefer to vote in - English, Chinese, Spanish, or Filipino. The font size of the information appearing on the screen can also be adjusted. Next, the voter will click on the "Continue" button.

iv. In accordance with the California Secretary of State's approval of the system, the next screen requires the voter to read several affirmations and confirm their eligibility to access the system. The voter will check a box next to the statement certifying that all information is true. Next, the voter will click on the "Continue" button.

v. Next, the voter will be presented with instructions for returning their ballot. Instructions can also be downloaded on to the device the voter is using. This page also contains the Department's contact information in case the voter has questions or need assistance. On the bottom of this page the voter will click, "continue" to mark their ballot.

vi. The ballot will then be presented onscreen in an accessible format, compatible with screen readers. A voter can also use an assistive device to mark their selections by clicking on a checkbox next to the candidate or measure they wish to vote for. Clicking the checkbox again will remove the selection. To vote for a qualified write-in candidate who is not listed on the ballot, the voter will click the

checkbox beside the WRITE-IN space at the end of the candidate list and type the candidate's name in the space. Once the ballot is marked, clicking on the "Continue" button at the bottom of the screen will direct the voter to the review screen.

vii. In the review screen, if the voter wishes to change any selection, this can be done by clicking the "change" button next to the specific contest. When finished reviewing, the voter will click "continue" at the bottom of the screen.

viii. After marking the ballot, the voter must print the ballot and return it to the Department. The voter will click the "Print Selections" button. There is a warning that appears on this screen that reads "Closing your section will clear all your ballot selections. This cannot be undone". If the voter clicks the "End Session" button without printing their ballot they will have to start the voting process over. Selections are not saved and a partially completed ballot cannot be re-opened.

ix. The print preview screen and the printed ballot will be one page only. If a voter chooses not to vote on a contest, "Zero Selections Made" will appear next to it. In the top right corner there will be a QR code containing the voter's ballot selections. This QR code does not hold any voter-identifying information such as voter ID, name or address. If the code is scanned, a list of numbers that corresponds to contest numbers and selected choices will appear. The example below explains these numbers in more detail.

1. v:1.2 – these numbers identify a version of Democracy Live system that San Francisco is using
2. bs:10 – these numbers identify a ballot style or ballot type; in this case it's ballot type 10
3. pid:7866 – these numbers identify a voter's precinct number; in this case it's pct 7866
4. id:1524168223717.505– these numbers identify a ballot serial number; it's an equivalent of a serial number printed on a paper ballot stub
5. 1:13 - The first number identifies the contest and corresponds to the order in which the contest appears on the voter's ballot. The second number identifies the candidate that the voter selected which corresponds to the order in which the candidate's name is listed on the voter's ballot. In this case, the numbers refer to the first contest on the ballot and the person voted for the thirteenth candidate listed for that contest. For measures, "1" corresponds to a "Yes" vote and "2" corresponds to a "No" vote.

x. Once the ballot is printed the voter is ready to prepare the ballot for return. There are several different ways a voter can return their ballot.

1. Every vote-by-mail voter who uses the RAVBM System will still receive a paper ballot, a postage-paid return envelope, and voting instructions in the mail. The voter may use this postage-paid return envelope to return their RAVBM ballot. This envelope must be signed and the signature on vote-by-mail ballot must compare to the signature on the voter's registration record. There are holes on the envelopes indicate the edges of the

signature section where a voter can sign. If they are unable to sign, they may make a "mark" and have a witness sign it.

2. If a voter is unable to return their ballot, they may authorize anyone to return it by providing the required information on the back of the envelope. If the voter lost or spoiled their return ballot envelope, they may contact the Department and we will mail a replacement envelope.

3. A voter may also use their own envelope. If using their own envelope, a voter will need to print, complete, and sign the Voter Oath, which is available on the instructions screen. The Department will use this Oath to verify the signature as required under state election law. The envelope should be addressed in the following way: Department of Elections, VBM Enclosed, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48, San Francisco, CA 94102.

4. A voter may also return ballot in person to the City Hall Voting Center which is open now through Election Day, Tuesday, June 5, from 8 a.m. to 5 p.m. during weekdays, and 10 a.m. to 4 p.m. during two weekends prior to Election Day. On Election Day, the Voting Center observes the same hours as polling places, 7 a .m. to 8 p.m.

5. A voter may also bring your ballot to the drop-off stations located outside City Hall during the four days prior to Election Day or to any California polling place or voting center prior to and on Election Day.

xi. Ballots that are returned by mail must be postmarked on or before Election Day, Tuesday June 5 and received by the Department no later than Friday, June 8. Ballots that are returned in person must be received by the Department no later than 8 p.m. on Election Day.

f. How does the system ensure voter's privacy and security of selections?

i. The system does not identify or keep track of its users. It only requires voters to acknowledge that they are eligible to use it before accessing their ballots. This requirement is in accordance with certification of the system by the California Secretary of State.

ii. Also in accordance with certification, the portion of the process during which a person marks selections on the ballot does not at any time interact with any remote server. The ballot marking process takes place solely on the device the voter is using to access the system. The system does not store or transmit votes over the internet and it does not allow electronic voting.

iii. When the Department receives the voter's ballot, his or her selections will be transferred onto a paper ballot for tabulation by the voting equipment. During this process, to preserve the secrecy of the votes, Department staff will remove and separate the ballot from the envelope that has the voter's name, address, and signature. This process is done in a multi-person team, and is open to public observation and live-streamed on sfelections.org.

g. If anyone has any questions about the RAVBM System or accessing, marking, or returning their ballot they may contact the Department by calling (415) 554-4375; (866) 325-9163 toll free; by emailing sfvote@sfgov.org; or by visiting City Hall, Room 48: Monday-Friday, 8 a.m. – 5 p.m.

2. The group responded to the RAVBM presentations with some questions
    a. When will the Department process RAVBM ballots? In accordance with state election law, the Department will process RAVBM ballots in the same manner as all vote-by-mail ballots. Ten business days before the election the Department will begin processing vote-by-mail ballots.
    b. What is the QR code used for? Other counties use a ballot print on demand system for the re-make process; however, San Francisco does not use this system.
    c. How do ranked-choice voting contests appear on the RAVBM? All candidates appear on one screen with the titles, "first choice," "second choice," "third choice."
    d. If a voter chooses to use the RAVBM System, what should they do with the ballot they received in the mail? Recycle or shred the mailed ballot.
    e. When is the last day to apply as a vote-by-mail voter? Tuesday, May 29

3. Nicole Bohn gave a presentation from the Mayor's Office on Disability
    a. Connect with Tech Week, sponsored by the San Francisco Public Library, is a citywide initiative to promote online access, skill-building, and to reduce digital disparities in the community. Activities will take place May 7 – May 12. The group may contact Marti Goddard, SFPL Access Services for more information.
    b. Supervisor Yee coordinated a hearing on May 9 regarding employment opportunities for older adults and people with disabilities. This included various presentations from City Departments and information about local programs and services.
    c. The Accessible Building Ordinance proposed by Supervisor Tang which discusses barrier removal, sidewalk improvement, and appropriate inspections of buildings and entries has established phase compliance deadlines, and a public workshop will take place on Wednesday, May 16.
    d. The 2018 Bay Area Regional Community Resilience Summit will also take place on Wednesday, May 16 and will include planning for emergencies for people with disabilities, with specific content on community building
    e. Better Market Street is working to improve the experience for people walking, rolling, bicycling, and riding transit on Market Street
    f. It in honor of Hard of Hearing Awareness Month,one of the items on the May 18, 2018 meeting of the Mayor's Disability Council is a presentation on services for those who are hard of hearing and have dementia
    g. BART is addressing elevator attendance and cleanliness by providing elevator attendants at two San Francisco BART stations as part of a six-month pilot program
    h. On April 26 there was a Mayoral Town Hall organized by the Dignity Fund Coalition where the public had a conversation with four mayoral candidates and discussed relevant issues for seniors and people with disabilities.

i. Senator Hill has drafted preliminary legislation for making Transportation Network Companies (TNC), such as Uber and Lyft, accountable for providing accessible services. For more information, refer to the text of the Senate Bill [SB-1376 Transportation network companies: accessibility plans.](#) This proposed legislation has now gone through 3 phases of comment period.

4. Steven Bennett, Regional Sales Manager, from Dominion Voting gave a demonstration on the next voting system (Version 5.2) which will be available in 2019 for San Francisco voters. Dominion is the same company supporting the current voting system. This system has been certified by the California Secretary of State, while changes cannot be made right away, feedback is welcome. Denver, Colorado has used this voting system in their last election.

   a. Dominion is focusing on providing more "off-the-shelf" products, meaning the software and hardware products are ready-made and available for sale to the general public.

   b. Dominion is making the new voting system more efficient, more secure, and more transparent.

   c. Dominion's **Election Event Designer** allows County Elections Officials to have a high degree of flexibility in the ballot layout and design.

      i. Paper ballots are lighter and shorter (8 ½ x 11 or 8 ½ x 18) which will reduce cost.

      ii. Ranked-Choice Voting contests have been redesigned to eliminate the three columns and allow more space so voters may rank up to ten candidates on one card. This can help reduce the number of ballot cards needed for each election.

   d. Dominion's **Image Cast X** will be available at San Francisco polling locations. All voters use the same device to vote privately and independently. This is a touch screen voting system (21-inch screen) that will be connected to a printer. Voters will watch their ballot print immediately after voting, put it in a secrecy sleeve, and drop the voted ballot into the secure ballot box. Voters will be given an activated voter card containing their specific ballot type.

      i. This technology has integrated accessibility components that are fully ADA compliant including an Audio Tactile Interface (ATI), compatibility with many assistive devices, on-screen text contrast and size adjustments.

         1. County Elections Officials can use synthesized speech or record their own voice for the audio version of the ballot.

      ii. This system also has the ability to translate the ballot into 14 different languages

      iii. There are over-vote and under-vote warnings.

      iv. The voting system sits in a voting booth that is 31 inches from the floor. Once the voting booth is set-up it is at a set height and width.

   e. Dominion's **AuditMark** technology leaves a visual audit trail, allowing results to be audited down to each individual ballot. Image copies of the ballot are stored and there is also a record of how the voter's selections were interpreted by the tabulator in a ballot log file. This system also lets you know if something happens on the ballot and where it happened.

   f. Once scanned, Dominion's **Adjudication** process out-stacks ballots with certain conditions that will need to be reviewed. These ballots require resolution based on the voter's intent.

Anyone reviewing a ballot will be able to see how the voter marked their ballot, how the scanner interpreted the intent, and how the ballot was adjudicated.

    i. The goal is to speed-up the re-make process while decreasing costs.

g. Dominion's **Image Cast Evolution** is an all-in-one tabulator and accessible ballot marking device. It retains a secure digital image of every ballot cast. It also displays messages if there is anything preventing the ballot from being tabulated.

    i. If a voter would like to use this voting system to mark their ballot electronically a library of human-hand marks and writing is used to protect voter privacy.

    ii. This voting machine contains a memory card where every action is logged and what time the action happened, for example, each time the door is opened for a ballot transfer.

    iii. The machine is designed to push out a ballot if it cannot go in, and the poll worker will receive a message saying there is a problem. There is a visual message displayed on the screen and an audio warning beep. Depending on which language the voter is voting in, the message will appear in that language.

    iv. If there is a larger issue with the machine, it will shut down.